HENRY MCMASTER, CHAIR GOVERNOR CURTIS M. LOFTIS, JR. STATE TREASURER BRIAN J. GAINES COMPTROLLER GENERAL



HARVEY S. PEELER. JR. CHAIRMAN, SENATE FINANCE COMMITTEE BRUCE W. BANNISTER CHAIRMAN, HOUSE WAYS AND MEANS COMMITTEE GRANT GILLESPIE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

THE DIVISION OF PROCUREMENT SERVICES DELBERT H. SINGLETON, JR. DIVISION DIRECTOR (803) 734-8018 JOHN ST. C. WHITE MATERIALS MANAGEMENT OFFICER (803) 737-0600 FAX: (803) 737-0639

# **Protest Decision**

Matter of:	Roofing Professionals Incorporated (RPI)
File No.:	2024-007
Posting Date:	May 14, 2024
<b>Contracting Entity:</b>	Denmark Technical College
Project No.:	H59-6259-PD
Description:	Campus Roof Replacements

# DIGEST

Protest arguing a bid that was not opened at the scheduled time and place should not be considered is denied where, after bid opening, the agency discovered a bid that was delivered to the location specified in the invitation for bid before the deadline for submitting bids.

# AUTHORITY

Per S.C. Code Ann. § 11-35-4210, the Chief Procurement Officer for Construction (CPOC)<sup>1</sup> conducted an administrative review of a protest filed by Roofing Professionals Incorporated, (RPI). RPI's protest is attached as [Exhibit A]. This decision is based on materials in the procurement file and applicable law and precedents.

# BACKGROUND

On April 1, 2024, RPI emailed the CPOC a protest of Denmark Technical College's (DTC) intent to award a contract to Owens Roofing Inc (Owens), to replace the roof on the low-sloped areas down to the existing roof decks for Rhoad Hall, Blatt Hall, and Smith Hall, (the Project). The following are relevant to this protest:

• On January 22, 2024, DTC issued an SE-310 invitation for bids to perform the work of the project. [Exhibit B]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Per section 11-35-840, the CPOC delegated the administrative review of this protest to the Deputy to the State Engineer, Clint Burdett.

Protest Decision, page 2 File No. 2024-007 May 14, 2024

- The invitation for bids provided for hand delivery and mail service delivery of bids to the attention of Jessica Goff at 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd., Denmark, S.C. 29042. [Id.]
- Bidders were required to deliver bids to DTC no later than 2 PM on February 22, 2024. [Id.]
- On February 21, 2024, at 1:05 PM, FedEx delivered a bid from Owens Roofing, Inc., (Owens) of Smithfield, North Carolina, to the attention of Jessica Goff at 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd., Denmark, S.C. 29042. [Exhibit C]
- On February 22, 2024, at 9:52 AM, FedEx delivered a bid from AAR of North Carolina, Inc., (AAR) of Kernersville, North Carolina, to Jessica Goff at 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd., Denmark, S.C. 29042. [Exhibit D]
- On Thursday February 22, 2024, at 2 PM, Andrew Lindler, publicly opened bids on behalf of DTC in the second-floor conference room of DTC's Blatt Building. At the bid opening, Mr. Lindler had seven bids present which he opened. [Exhibit E, 1<sup>st</sup> page] After opening these seven bids, RPI was the apparent low bidder. However, Mr. Lindler did not have the bids from either Owens or AAR present.
- The following Friday, February 23, 2024, DTC realized that it inadvertently failed to have present at the bid opening the bids of Owens and AAR and as a result failed to open those bids.
- On Monday, February 26, 2024, DTC contacted the Office of State Engineer Project Manager, Perry Derrick, to decide what to do. Mr. Derrick advised DTC that if they received the bids at the location specified in the invitation for bids before the deadline for receipt of bids, they had to open and consider the bids. Thereafter, DTC opened the bids of Owens and AAR. [Exhibit E, page 2] Owens was now the low bidder.
- On March 18, 2024, DTC posted a Notice of Intent to Award a contract to Owens. [Exhibit F]

# DISCUSSION

The following provisions of law and regulation are applicable to this protest:

## S.C. Code Ann. §11-35-1520. Competitive sealed bidding.

(1) Condition for Use. Contracts must be awarded by competitive sealed bidding except as otherwise provided in Section 11-35-1510.

\*\*\*

(4) Receipt and Safeguarding of Bids. All bids, including modifications, received before the time of opening must be kept secure and unopened, except as provided by regulation of the board.

(5) Bid Opening. Bids must be opened publicly in the presence of one or more witnesses, at the time and place designated in the invitation for bids and in the manner prescribed by regulation of the board. The amount of each bid, and other relevant information as may be specified by regulation, together with the name of each bidder, must be tabulated. The tabulation must be open to public inspection at that time.

[emphasis supplied]

Protest Decision, page 3 File No. 2024-007 May 14, 2024

## S.C. Code Ann. §11-35-3020. Additional bidding procedures for construction procurement.

Exceptions in Competitive Sealed Bidding Procedures. The process of competitive sealed bidding as required by Section 11-35-3015(2)(b) must be performed in accordance with the procedures outlined in Article 5 of this code subject to the following exceptions:

\*\*\*

(c) Instead of Section 11-35-1520(10), the following provisions apply:

(i) Unless there is a compelling reason to reject bids as prescribed by regulation of the board, notice of an intended award of a contract to the lowest responsive and responsible bidder whose bid meets the requirements set forth in the invitation for bids must be given by posting the notice at a location that is specified in the invitation for bids.

[emphasis supplied]

### Regulation 19-445.2050 Bid Opening.

A. Procedures.

The procurement officer of the governmental body or his designee shall decide when the time set for bid opening has arrived, and shall so declare to those present. In the presence of one or more state witnesses, **he shall then personally and publicly open all bids received prior to that time**, and read aloud so much thereof as is practicable, including prices, to those persons present and have the bids recorded. The amount of each bid and such other relevant information, together with the name of each bidder, shall be tabulated and certified in writing as true an accurate by both the person opening the bids and the witness. The tabulation shall be open to public inspection.

[emphasis supplied]

## Regulation 19-445.2065 Rejection of Bids.

A. Unless there is a compelling reason to reject one or more bids, **award will be made to the lowest responsible and responsive bidder**.

## **Regulation 19-445.2070. Rejection of Individual Bids.**

G. Exceptions to Rejection Procedures.

Any bid received after the procurement officer of the governmental body or his designee has declared that the time set for bid opening has arrived, shall be rejected **unless the bid had been delivered to the location specified in the solicitation or the governmental bodies'** [sic] **mail room which services that location prior to the bid opening**.

[emphasis supplied]

Protest Decision, page 4 File No. 2024-007 May 14, 2024

These provisions must be read together. Taken together, these provisions required DTC to open and consider all bids received by the time of bid opening at the time and place specified in the solicitation. They also limit DTC's ability to reject any or all bids. Specifically, they prohibit DTC from rejecting a bid that was timely delivered to a place specified in the solicitation solely on the basis that it was not opened and read at the time and place of bid opening. The law is clear that in such case the bid must be opened and considered even though the bid was not opened and read aloud at the public bid opening.<sup>2</sup> S.C. Code Ann. Reg. 19-445.2070(G); *Appeal by M.L.Clapp Construction Company*, Panel Case No. 1987-9.

As required by law, once DTC became aware that it had timely received a bid from Owens, it opened and considered Owen's bid and found it to be responsive. Thereafter, DTC appropriately included Owens bid price in its official bid tabulation and properly posted a Notice of Intent to Award a contract to Owens.

### DECISION

For the forgoing reasons, protest denied.

Clint Burdett, AIA Deputy to the State Engineer acting on behalf of the Chief Procurement Officer for Construction

Columbia, South Carolina

 $<sup>^{2}</sup>$  As a practical matter, if the rule were otherwise, a State Agency could direct an award to their preferred contractor simply by failing to read aloud the bids of selected bidders.

## STATEMENT OF RIGHT TO FURTHER ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW

Protest Appeal Notice (Revised July 2023)

The South Carolina Procurement Code, in Section 11-35-4210, subsection 6, states:

(6) Finality of Decision. A decision pursuant to subsection (4) is final and conclusive, unless fraudulent or unless a person adversely affected by the decision requests a further administrative review by the Procurement Review Panel pursuant to Section 11-35-4410(1) within ten days of posting of the decision in accordance with subsection (5). The request for review must be directed to the appropriate chief procurement officer, who shall forward the request to the panel or to the Procurement Review Panel, and must be in writing, setting forth the reasons for disagreement with the decision of the appropriate chief procurement officer. The person also may request a hearing before the Procurement Review Panel. The appropriate chief procurement officer and an affected governmental body shall have the opportunity to participate fully in a later review or appeal, administrative or judicial.

-----

Copies of the Panel's decisions and other additional information regarding the protest process is available on the internet at the following web site: http://procurement.sc.gov

FILING FEE: Pursuant to Proviso 111.1 of the 2023 General Appropriations Act, "[r]equests for administrative review before the South Carolina Procurement Review Panel shall be accompanied by a filing fee of two hundred and fifty dollars (\$250.00), payable to the SC Procurement Review Panel. The panel is authorized to charge the party requesting an administrative review under the South Carolina Code Sections 11-35-4210(6), 11-35-4220(5), 11-35-4230(6) and/or 11-35-4410...Withdrawal of an appeal will result in the filing fee being forfeited to the panel. If a party desiring to file an appeal is unable to pay the filing fee because of financial hardship, the party shall submit a completed Request for Filing Fee Waiver form at the same time the request for review is filed. [The Request for Filing Fee Waiver form is attached to this Decision.] If the filing fee is not waived, the party must pay the filing fee within fifteen days of the date of receipt of the order denying waiver of the filing fee. Requests for administrative review will not be accepted unless accompanied by the filing fee or a completed Request for Filing Fee Waiver form at the time of filing." PLEASE MAKE YOUR CHECK PAYABLE TO THE "SC PROCUREMENT REVIEW PANEL."

LEGAL REPRESENTATION: In order to prosecute an appeal before the Panel, business entities organized and registered as corporations, limited liability companies, and limited partnerships must be represented by a lawyer. Failure to obtain counsel will result in dismissal of your appeal. *Protest of Lighting Services*, Case No. 2002-10 (Proc. Rev. Panel Nov. 6, 2002) and *Protest of The Kardon Corporation*, Case No. 2002-13 (Proc. Rev. Panel Jan. 31, 2003); and *Protest of PC&C Enterprises, LLC*, Case No. 2012-1 (Proc. Rev. Panel April 2, 2012). However, individuals and those operating as an individual doing business under a trade name may proceed without counsel, if desired.

# South Carolina Procurement Review Panel Request for Filing Fee Waiver 1105 Pendleton Street, Suite 209, Columbia, SC 29201

Name of R	Requestor		Address
City	State	Zip	Business Phone
1. What is	your/your compa	ny's monthly incom	e?
2. What ar	e your/your com	pany's monthly expe	nses?
3. List any	other circumstar	nces which you think	affect your/your company's ability to pay the filing fee:
misreprese administra Sworn to b	ent my/my comp tive review be wa	any's financial cond	n above is true and accurate. I have made no attempt to dition. I hereby request that the filing fee for requesting
Notary Pul	blic of South Car	olina	Requestor/Appellant
My Comm	nission expires: _		
For officia	l use only:	Fee Waived	Waiver Denied
Chairman	or Vice Chairman	n, SC Procurement R	Leview Panel
This Columbia,	_day of South Carolina	, 20	
NOTE: If	your filing fee r	equest is denied, voi	u will be expected to pay the filing fee within fifteen (15

days of the date of receipt of the order denying the waiver.





505 CDP Industrial Blvd. Grovetown, GA 30813 PHONE: (706) 945-0101 FAX: (706) 945-0102 www.rpiroof.com

April 1, 2024

Attn: Chief Procurement Officer for Construction Office of State Engineer

## Re: Denmark Technical College Campus Roof Replacements Project Number: H59-6259-PD

Pursuant to SC Code 11-35-4210 "RIGHT TO PROTEST", Roofing Professionals Incorporated ("RPI") challenges the Notice of Intent to Award- Design-Bid-Build Contract for the Denmark Technical College- Campus Roof Replacements- Project Number H59-6259-PD ("The project") dated 3/18/2024.

The apparent low bid referred to in the Notice of Intent to Award was not present at the official time for receipt and was opened after the deadline. Section 4.3 – "Submission of Bids", article 4.3.6 (Exhibit A) states "The official time for receipt of Bids will be determined by reference to the clock designated by the Owner's Procurement Officer or his/her designee. The Procurement Officer conducting the Bid Opening will determine and announce that the <u>deadline</u> has arrived and <u>no further Bids or bid modifications will be</u> accepted." Because of the failure to meet bid submission requirements clearly outlined in Section 4.3- "Submission of Bids", namely articles 4.3.3, 4.3.4, 4.3.5 and 4.3.6, the apparent low bid should be rejected and awarded to the low bid that meets all documented requirements.

Best regards,

Jordan Bradford Chief Sales Officer **§ 4.1.6** Pursuant to S.C. Code Ann. § 11-35-3020(b)(i), as amended, Section 7 of the Bid Form sets forth a list of proposed subcontractors for which the Bidder is required to identify those subcontractors the Bidder will use to perform the work listed. Bidder must follow the instructions in the Bid Form for filling out this section of the Bid Form. Failure to properly fill out Section 7 may result in rejection of Bidder's bid as non-responsive.

**§ 4.1.7** Contractors and subcontractors listed in Section 7 of the Bid Form who are required by the South Carolina Code of Laws to be licensed, must be licensed as required by law at the time of bidding.

**§ 4.1.8** Each copy of the Bid shall state the legal name and legal status of the Bidder. Each copy of the Bid shall be signed by the person or persons legally authorized to bind the Bidder to a contract.

§ 4.1.9 A Bidder shall incur all costs associated with the preparation of its Bid.

#### § 4.2 Bid Security

**§ 4.2.1** If required by the invitation to bid, each Bid shall be accompanied by a bid security in an amount of not less than five percent of the Base Bid. The bid security shall be a bid bond or a certified cashier's check.

**§ 4.2.2** The Bidder pledges to enter into a Contract with the Owner on the terms stated in the Bid and shall, if required, furnish bonds covering the faithful performance of the Contract and payment of all obligations arising thereunder. Should the Bidder refuse to enter into such Contract or fail to furnish such bonds if required, the amount of the bid security shall be forfeited to the Owner as liquidated damages, not as a penalty.

§ 4.2.3 If a surety bond is required as bid security, it shall be written on AIA Document  $A310^{TM}$ , Bid Bond and the attorney-in-fact who executes the bond on behalf of the surety shall affix to the bond a certified and current copy of an acceptable power of attorney. The Bid Bond shall:

- .1 be issued by a surety company licensed to do business in South Carolina;
- .2 be issued by a surety company having, at a minimum, a "Best Rating" of "A" as stated in the most current publication of "Best's Key Rating Guide, Property-Casualty", which company shows a financial strength rating of at least five (5) times the contract price.
- .3 be enclosed in the bid envelope at the time of Bid Opening, either in paper copy or as an electronic bid bond authorization number provided on the Bid Form and issued by a firm or organization authorized by the surety to receive, authenticate and issue binding electronic bid bonds on behalf the surety.

**§ 4.2.4** The Owner will have the right to retain the bid security of Bidders to whom an award is being considered until either (a) the Contract has been executed and performance and payment bonds, if required, have been furnished; (b) the specified time has elapsed so that Bids may be withdrawn; or (c) all Bids have been rejected.

**§ 4.2.5** By submitting a Bid Bond via an electronic bid bond authorization number on the Bid Form and signing the Bid Form, the Bidder certifies that an electronic bid bond has been executed by a Surety meeting the standards required by the Bidding Documents and the Bidder and Surety are firmly bound unto the State of South Carolina under the conditions provided in this Section 4.2.

#### § 4.3 Submission of Bids

§ 4.3.1 A Bidder shall submit its Bid as indicated below:

**§ 4.3.2** All paper copies of the Bid, the bid security, and any other documents required to be submitted with the Bid shall be enclosed in a sealed opaque envelope. The envelope shall, unless hand delivered by the Bidder, be addressed to the Owner's designated purchasing office as shown in the invitation to bid. The envelope shall be identified with the Project name, the Bidder's name and address, and, if applicable, the designated portion of the Work for which the Bid is submitted. If the Bid is sent by mail, or special delivery service (UPS, Federal Express, etc.), the sealed envelope shall be labelled "SEALED BID ENCLOSED" on the face thereof. Bidders hand delivering their Bids shall deliver Bids to the place of the Bid Opening as shown in the invitation for bids. Whether or not Bidders attend the Bid Opening, they shall give their Bids to the Owner's Procurement Officer or his/her designee as shown in the invitation to bid prior to the time of the Bid Opening.

**§ 4.3.3** Bids shall be submitted by the date and time and at the place indicated in the invitation to bid. Bids submitted after the date and time for receipt of Bids, or at an incorrect place, will not be accepted.

7

§ 4.3.4 The Bidder shall assume full responsibility for timely delivery at the location designated for receipt of Bids.

**§ 4.3.5** A Bid submitted by any method other than as provided in this Section 4.3 will not be accepted. Oral, telephonic, telegraphic, facsimile or other electronically transmitted bids will not be considered.

**§ 4.3.6** The official time for receipt of Bids will be determined by reference to the clock designated by the Owner's Procurement Officer or his/her designee. The Procurement Officer conducting the Bid Opening will determine and announce that the deadline has arrived and no further Bids or bid modifications will be accepted. All Bids and bid modifications in the possession of the Procurement Officer at the time the announcement is completed will be timely, whether or not the bid envelope has been date/time stamped or otherwise marked by the Procurement Officer.

### § 4.4 Modification or Withdrawal of Bid

**§ 4.4.1** Prior to the date and time designated for receipt of Bids, a Bidder may submit a new Bid to replace a Bid previously submitted, or withdraw its Bid entirely, by notice to the party designated to receive the Bids. Such notice shall be received and duly recorded by the receiving party on or before the date and time set for receipt of Bids. The receiving party shall verify that replaced or withdrawn Bids are removed from the other submitted Bids and not considered. Notice of submission of a replacement Bid or withdrawal of a Bid shall be worded so as not to reveal the amount of the original Bid.

**§ 4.4.2** Withdrawn Bids may be resubmitted up to the date and time designated for the receipt of Bids in the same format as that established in Section 4.3, provided they fully conform with these Instructions to Bidders. Bid security shall be in an amount sufficient for the Bid as resubmitted.

## ARTICLE 5 CONSIDERATION OF BIDS

#### § 5.1 Opening of Bids

Bids received on time will be publicly opened and read aloud. The Owner will not read aloud Bids that the Owner determines, at the time of opening, to be non-responsive.

**§ 5.1.1** At Bid Opening, the Owner will announce the date and location of the posting of the Notice of Intend to Award. If the Owner determines to award the Project, the Owner will, after posting a Notice of Intend to Award, send a copy of the Notice to all Bidders.

**§ 5.1.2** The Owner will send a copy of the final Bid Tabulation to all Bidders within ten (10) working days of the Bid Opening.

§ 5.1.3 If only one Bid is received, the Owner will open and consider the Bid.

#### § 5.2 Rejection of Bids

§ 5.2.1 The Owner shall have the right to reject any or all Bids. A Bid not accompanied by a required bid security or by other data required by the Bidding Documents, or a Bid which is in any way incomplete or irregular is subject to rejection.

§ 5.2.2 The reasons for which the Owner will reject Bids include, but are not limited to:

- .1 Failure by a Bidder to be represented at a Mandatory Pre-Bid Conference or site visit;
- .2 Failure to deliver the Bid on time;
- .3 Failure to comply with Bid Security requirements, except as expressly allowed by law;
- .4 Listing an invalid electronic Bid Bond authorization number on the Bid Form;
- .5 Failure to Bid an Alternate, except as expressly allowed by law;
- .6 Failure to list qualified subcontractors as required by law;
- .7 Showing any material modification(s) or exception(s) qualifying the Bid;
- .8 Faxing a Bid directly to the Owner or Owner's representative; or
- .9 Failure to include a properly executed Power-of-Attorney with the Bid Bond.

**§ 5.2.3** The Owner may reject a Bid as nonresponsive if the prices bid are materially unbalanced between line items or sub-line items. A Bid is materially unbalanced when it is based on prices significantly less than cost for some work and prices which are significantly overstated in relation to cost for other work, and if there is a reasonable doubt that the Bid

8

# EXHIBIT B

AGENCY/OWNER: Denmark Technical College	
PROJECT NAME: Campus Roof Replacements	
	STRUCTION COST RANGE: \$ 970,000 to \$ 1,120,000
PROJECT LOCATION: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd.,	
the existing roof decks on Rhoad Hall (Kitchen/Culinar	e of work includes roof replacement of the low slope roof areas down ( ry Arts), Blatt Hall and Smith Hall. Roof replacement includes roof dec en roof system. Associated sheet metal components and accessories an
BID/SUBMITTAL DUE DATE: 2/22/24	TIME: 2:00 PM NUMBER OF COPIES: 1
PROJECT DELIVERY METHOD: Design-Bid-Bu	lild
AGENCY PROJECT COORDINATOR: Jessica Go	off
EMAIL: goffj@denmarktech.edu	TELEPHONE: 803-793-5264
DOCUMENTS MAY BE OBTAINED FROM: chris@wmbeconsultants.com or (803) 260-4532	WM Building Envelope Consultants by contacting Chris Waites a
any other source do so at their own risk. All written communications	
Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. All guestions & correspondence concerning this Invitation shall be ac A/E NAME: WM Building Envelope Consultants, LL	source(s) to be listed as an official plan holder. Bidders that rely on copies obtained from s with official plan holders & bidders will be via email or website posting.
Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. All guestions & correspondence concerning this Invitation shall be ac A/E NAME: WM Building Envelope Consultants, LL	source(s) to be listed as an official plan holder. Bidders that rely on copies obtained from s with official plan holders & bidders will be via email or website posting.
Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. All guestions & correspondence concerning this Invitation shall be ac A/E NAME: WM Building Envelope Consultants, LL/ EMAIL: chris@wmbeconsultants.com PRE-BID CONFERENCE: Yes No PRE-BID DATE: 2/8/2024	source(s) to be listed as an official plan holder. Bidders that rely on copies obtained fro s with official plan holders & bidders will be via email or website posting. ddressed to the A/E. A/E CONTACT: Chris Waites TELEPHONE: 803-260-4532 MANDATORY ATTENDANCE: Yes No 2 TIME: 10:00 AM
Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. All questions & correspondence concerning this Invitation shall be ac A/E NAME: WM Building Envelope Consultants, LL4 EMAIL: chris@wmbeconsultants.com PRE-BID CONFERENCE: Yes No PRE-BID DATE: 2/8/2024 PRE-BID PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blva	source(s) to be listed as an official plan holder. Bidders that rely on copies obtained from s with official plan holders & bidders will be via email or website posting. ddressed to the A/E. A/E CONTACT: Chris Waites TELEPHONE: 803-260-4532 MANDATORY ATTENDANCE: Yes No Source State S
Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. All guestions & correspondence concerning this Invitation shall be ac A/E NAME: WM Building Envelope Consultants, LL EMAIL: chris@wmbeconsultants.com PRE-BID CONFERENCE: Yes No PRE-BID DATE: 2/8/2024 PRE-BID PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd., BID OPENING PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd.,	source(s) to be listed as an official plan holder. Bidders that rely on copies obtained from s with official plan holders & bidders will be via email or website posting. ddressed to the A/E. A/E CONTACT: Chris Waites TELEPHONE: 803-260-4532 MANDATORY ATTENDANCE: Yes No Z TIME: 10:00 AM
Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. All questions & correspondence concerning this Invitation shall be ac A/E NAME: WM Building Envelope Consultants, LL EMAIL: chris@wmbeconsultants.com PRE-BID CONFERENCE: Yes No PRE-BID DATE: 2/8/2024 PRE-BID PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd., BID OPENING PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd., BID DELIVERY ADDRESSES:	source(s) to be listed as an official plan holder. Bidders that rely on copies obtained from s with official plan holders & bidders will be via email or website posting. ddressed to the A/E. A/E CONTACT: Chris Waites TELEPHONE: 803-260-4532 MANDATORY ATTENDANCE: Yes No Source State S
Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. All questions & correspondence concerning this Invitation shall be ac A/E NAME: WM Building Envelope Consultants, LL4 EMAIL: chris@wmbeconsultants.com PRE-BID CONFERENCE: Yes No PRE-BID DATE: 2/8/2024 PRE-BID PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd. BID OPENING PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd., BID DELIVERY ADDRESSES: HAND-DELIVERY:	source(s) to be listed as an official plan holder. Bidders that rely on copies obtained from s with official plan holders & bidders will be via email or website posting.
Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. All guestions & correspondence concerning this Invitation shall be ac A/E NAME: WM Building Envelope Consultants, LLC EMAIL: chris@wmbeconsultants.com PRE-BID CONFERENCE: Yes No PRE-BID DATE: 2/8/2024 PRE-BID PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd., BID OPENING PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd., BID OPENING PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd., BID DELIVERY ADDRESSES: HAND-DELIVERY: Attn: Jessica Goff	source(s) to be listed as an official plan holder. Bidders that rely on copies obtained from s with official plan holders & bidders will be via email or website posting.
Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. All guestions & correspondence concerning this Invitation shall be ac A/E NAME: WM Building Envelope Consultants, LL/ EMAIL: chris@wmbeconsultants.com PRE-BID CONFERENCE: Yes No PRE-BID DATE: 2/8/2024 PRE-BID PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd. BID OPENING PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd. BID OPENING PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd. BID DELIVERY ADDRESSES: HAND-DELIVERY: Attn: Jessica Goff 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd.	source(s) to be listed as an official plan holder. Bidders that rely on copies obtained from s with official plan holders & bidders will be via email or website posting.
Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. All guestions & correspondence concerning this Invitation shall be ac A/E NAME: WM Building Envelope Consultants, LLC EMAIL: chris@wmbeconsultants.com PRE-BID CONFERENCE: Yes No PRE-BID DATE: 2/8/2024 PRE-BID PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd., BID OPENING PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd., BID DELIVERY ADDRESSES: HAND-DELIVERY: Attn: Jessica Goff	source(s) to be listed as an official plan holder. Bidders that rely on copies obtained fro s with official plan holders & bidders will be via email or website posting.
any other source do so at their own risk. All written communications Agency WILL NOT accept Bids sent via email. All questions & correspondence concerning this Invitation shall be ac A/E NAME: WM Building Envelope Consultants, LL/ EMAIL: chris@wmbeconsultants.com PRE-BID CONFERENCE: Yes No PRE-BID DATE: 2/8/2024 PRE-BID PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd. BID OPENING PLACE: 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd., BID DELIVERY ADDRESSES: HAND-DELIVERY: Attn: Jessica Goff 1126 Soloman Blatt Blvd.	source(s) to be listed as an official plan holder. Bidders that rely on copies obtained from s with official plan holders & bidders will be via email or website posting.

# Exhibit C

bluea@den...

80 (8)

271212848997

FedEx Fedex package #271212848997 www.fedex.com

# Delivered: Wed, Feb 21, 01:05 PM

Processed		In transit	Delivered
DATE	TIME	LOCATION	STATUS
Feb 21	1:05 PM	Denmark, SC, United States	Delivered
Feb 21	8:31 AM	West Columbia, SC, United States	On FedEx vehicle for delivery
Feb 21	7:42 AM	West Columbia, SC, United States	At local FedEx facility
Feb 20	10:19 PM	Memphis, TN, United States	Arrived at FedEx hub
Feb 20	7:07 PM	Wilson, NC, United States	Left FedEx origin facility

Data from fedex.com

27 Natural number

W

277 is the natural number following 276 and preceding 278.

Cardinal two hundred seventy-seven + Ordinal 277th · (two hundred seventy-... + Factorization prime Prime yes Greek numeral SOZ' Roman numeral CCLXXVII Binary 1000101012 Ternary 1010213

#### Explore more



Data: <u>Wikipedia</u> Wikipedia text under <u>CC-BY-SA license</u>

Feedback

Privacy and Cookies Legal

Advertise About our ads Help Feedback

Your Privacy Choices

© 2024 Microsc





#### Track UPS package

#### 1zx281751597467641

UPS package #1ZX281751597467641 www.ups.com

# Delivered: Thu, Feb 22, 09:52 AM

				L_D
Processe	d	In transit		Delivered
DATE	TIME	LOCATION	STATUS	
Feb 22	9:52 AM	Denmark, SC, United States	Delivered	
Feb 22	8:21 AM	Orangeburg, SC, United States	Out for delivery	
Feb 22	7:14 AM	Orangeburg, SC, United States	Arrived at facility	
Feb 22	6:19 AM	West Columbia, SC, United States	Departed from facility	
Feb 22	5:05 AM	West Columbia, SC, United States	Arrived at facility	

#### Data from ups.com

UPS ups

https://www.ups.com/track -

Tracking | UPS - United States

Web Filter By. Track one or multiple packages with UPS Tracking, use your tracking number to track the status of your package.

**View All Shipments** Join UPS My Choice® free and manage all your shipments fro...

Login Login - Tracking | UPS - United States

Change a Delivery Enter your UPS tracking number. Click "Correct my Address" T...

Understand and Pay Bills The UPS Billing Center. The UPS Billing Center allows you to vi...

How to Return a Package Your shipper may have included a label in your package, or ins...

How To Ship a Package Learn how to ship a package with UPS from these easy steps. ...

Other content from ups.com

Help and Support Center | Tracking | Ups - United States

View Shipping History | Tracking | Ups - United States

Ground Shipping Services - Rates & Delivery Times | Ups - United States

See more

UPS ups

https://www.ups.com/us/en/support/trackin... -

#### Tracking Support | UPS - United States

web Find answers to common questions about tracking your UPS package, such as delivery time, location, claims and more. Learn how to view tracking numbers, get photos of deliveries, and get help from UPS experts.



#### EXPLORE FURTHER

UPS Help Desk Contacts - LiveAgent

👹 Contact Us | About UPS

# Exhibit D

# Ups check status

Track

#### How do I track my Ups -**United States shipments?**

Track | UPS - United States Enter your tracking number to find the latest package status and estimated delivery date. You can also view your recently tracked shipments. ...

Track | UPS - United States www.ups.com/mobile/locationfor...

#### Explore More



Tracking Support | UPS -**United States** https://www.ups.com/us/e...



What is a up status

The UP status checker is a

tool used to view the status

the online applications you may have submitted to the

University of Pretoria (UP).

Students typically use a stat

UP status check 2023: How to CI

aucfinder.com/za/up-status-chec

checker?

File a Claim | UPS - United States https://www.ups.com/us/e.

## Trending on Bing ①



Brian Steven Smith found guilty



NEW imposes...



Nvidia valuation

nears \$2 trillion

Zendaya donates

to former theater

>



**NVIDIA** 

Sam Waterston

bids farewell



**CROWN** Act lawsuit



Try now

ups mobile tracking

Ask Copilot

ups delivery tracking



Biden





Contractor

Porter Roofing, Inc.

Roofing Professionals, Inc.

Roofco. Inc.

**Rike Roofing Services** 

Southern Roofing Services

C.E. Bourne and Co. Inc

Natious Roof of Carolina

# Exhibit E

Base Bid

\$896,000.00

\$750,000.00

\$837,500.00

\$969,887.00

\$843,800.00

\$1,159,951.00

\$940,000.00

#### Denmark Technical College - Campus Roof Replacements

Alternate No. 1

\$75,000.00 (deduct)

\$50,000.00 (deduct)

\$50,000.00 (deduct)

\$81,818.00 (deduct)

\$75,000.00 (deduct)

\$15,000.00 (add)

\$40,000.00 (deduct)

Bid Opening February 22, 2024 2:00 PM

Contractor Submitted/Acknowledged

Addenda Nos. 1, 2 & 3

Contractor License Number

Addenda Nos. 1, 2 & 3

Addenda Nos. 1. 2 & 3

Addenda Nos. 1, 2 & 3

Bid Bond

Bid Bond

Power of Att.

Unit Prices

Bid Bond

Power of Att.

Unit Prices

Bid Bond

Bid Bond

Power of Att.

Unit Prices

Bid Bond

Power of Att.

Unit Prices

Bid Bond

Power of Att.

Unit Prices

Bid Bond Power of Att. Unit Prices

Power of Att. Unit Prices

Power of Att. Unit Prices Provided

v

√

1

√ √

 $\checkmark$ 

 $\checkmark$ 

 $\checkmark$ 

√ √

<

 $\checkmark$ 

1

 $\checkmark$ 

√ √

<

<

√ √

√ √

√ √

 $\checkmark$ 

√

1

 $\checkmark$ 

√ √

1

1

√ √

√

#### State Project No. H59-6259-PD

Opened By:

Recorded By:



# Denmark Technical College - Campus Roof Replacements

State Pro	ect No.	. H59-6259-PD
-----------	---------	---------------

Contractor	Base Bid	Alternate No. 1	Contractor Submitted/Acknowledged	Provided
	\$689,330.00	\$120,500.00 (deduct)	Addenda Nos. 1, 2 & 3	~
* Owens Roofing, Inc.			Bid Bond	$\checkmark$
			Power of Att.	$\checkmark$
owens toomig, me.			Unit Prices	$\checkmark$
			Contractor License Number	$\checkmark$
	\$816,700.00	\$122,000.00 (deduct)	Addenda Nos. 1, 2 & 3	$\checkmark$
* AAR of NC			Bid Bond	$\checkmark$
			Power of Att.	$\checkmark$
			Unit Prices	$\checkmark$
			Contractor License Number	$\checkmark$

2/26/2024 -+++

\* The Bids were received by Denmark Technical college on time and the correct location but were not delivered to the place or at the time the other bids were opened and recorded.

Witness: Xel J 2/26/24

# Exhibit F

## SE-370 NOTICE OF INTENT TO AWARD - DESIGN-BID-BUILD CONTRACT

AGENCY:	Denmark	Technical	College
---------	---------	-----------	---------

**PROJECT NAME:** Campus Roof Replacements

PROJECT NUMBER: H59-6259-PD



#### **TO ALL BIDDERS:**

Unless stayed by protest or canceled, the Agency intends to enter into a contract as noted below. The successful bid will be accepted, and the contract formed by execution of the contract documents. All bid bonds remain in effect for the bid acceptance period as provided in Section 4 of the Bid Form, except as otherwise provided in the Instructions to Bidders.

NAME OF BIDDER: Owens Roofing, Inc.	
DATE BIDS WERE OPENED: 2/22/2024	
BID INFORMATION: BASE BID AMOUNT: ALTERNATES: #1 ACCEPTED #2 ACCEPTED #3 ACCEPTED	\$ <u>689,330.00</u> \$ <u>-120,500.00</u> \$
TOTAL BID AMOUNT: TOTAL CONTRACT AWARD:	\$ <u>689,330.00</u> \$ 689,330.00
	Bid Amount, explain any negotiations that resulted in the change.)

REMARKS: (If "No Contract to Be Awarded" was entered above, indicate the reason.)\_

Contractor should not incur any costs associated with the contract prior to receipt of a contract from the Agency for execution. Contractor should not perform any work before receipt of the Agency's written Notice to Proceed.

#### RIGHT TO PROTEST (SC Code § 11-35-4210)

Any actual bidder, offeror, contractor, or subcontractor who is aggrieved in connection with the intended award or award of this contract may be entitled to protest. To protest an award, you must (i) submit notice of your intent to protest within seven (7) business days of the date the award notice is posted, and (ii) submit your actual protest within fifteen (15) days of the date the award notice is posted. Days are calculated as provided in Section 11-35-310(13). Both protests and notices of intent to protest must be in writing and must be received by the appropriate Chief Procurement Officer within the time provided.

PROTEST CPO ADDRESS - OSE: Any protest must be addressed to the Chief Procurement Officer for Construction, Office of State Engineer, and submitted in writing (a) by email to: protest-ose@mmo.sc.gov, or (b) by post or delivery to 1201 Main Street, Suite 600, Columbia, SC 29201. By submitting a protest to the foregoing email address, you (and any person acting on your behalf) consent to receive communications regarding your protest (and any related protests) at the email address from which you sent your protest.

Jessica M. Gor (Print or Type) Agency Procurement Officer Signature)

#### **INSTRUCTIONS TO THE AGENCY:**

- 1. Post a copy of the SE-370 at the location specified by the Instructions to Bidders and announced at the Bid Opening.
- 2. Send the SE-370 and the final Bid Tabulation electronically to all Bidders and OSE (if required) the same day it is posted.